Clack Campus Development Guidelines

AFFORDABLE

Y CENTER

- Careles

PERR AL

GROCERY S

April 2022 - FINAL DRAFT

AFFORDABLE

MIXED-INCOME

FAMILY

EVENT PLAZA

Prepared for:





Prepared by: studio for spatial practice



100.

ASTL

ree

WELCOME

Dear Neighbors,

Too often, the community is forced to react to development plans driven by financial pro formas that disregard community priorities, or plans that are so far into development that there are few opportunities for the community to intervene.

When Allegheny County Economic Development (ACED) shared plans to potentially relocate the Frank B. Clack Health Center campus, we saw an opportunity to flip the script and set standards for redevelopment before the property transferred from public to private hands, and work to set a precedent of community involvement in future public property disposition.

The resulting planning process was unlike any other in Lawrenceville. Inspired by Bloomfield Development Corporation's success in creating development guidelines for the Shursave site just two years prior, we partnered with Studio for Spatial Practice and Architect Kisha Patterson to create a process that was fun, inclusive, and safe from COVID-19 transmission. The process enabled our community to dream bigger than "good enough" and understand their collective power, and the finished product will serve as a tool for realizing our shared vision over the next few years.

We are deeply inspired by our community's willingness to show up meeting after meeting; to recognize the need for maintaining community uses, expanding accessibility and affordability; and balance new development with a celebration of the neighborhood's history. Whether you are a neighbor, community partner, or developer, we hope that you can find inspiration in the following pages. May this document guide your plans and actions, and may it set the path for future development at the Frank B. Clack Health Center campus.

Sincerely,



Lauren Byrne Connelly Executive Director Lawrenceville Corporation



Dave Breingan Executive Director Lawrenceville United

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PROJECT TEAM

Lawrenceville Corporation

Lauren Byrne Connelly - Executive Director Emily Persico - Community Development Manager

Lawrenceville United

Dave Breingan - Executive Director Helen Gerhardt - Community Engagement + Program Manager

CONSULTANTS

Studio for Spatial Practice Community Planning & Urban Design

Kisha Patterson, Architect Preservation Planning

STEERING COMMITTEE

Action Housing Lena Andrews - Director of Real Estate Development James Eash - Real Estate Development Officer

Allegheny County Economic Development

Lance Chimka - Director Erin Deasy - Manager, Development Matt Trepal - Manager, Planning Division Susheela Nemani-Stanger - Deputy Director, Operations Dora Walmsley - Assistant Director of Development

Bloomfield Development Corporation Christina Howell - Executive Director

City Planning - City of Pittsburgh

Andrea Lavin Kossis - Riverfront Development Coordinator

Urban Redevelopment Authority of Pittsburgh

Maya Fews - Neighborhood Development Specialist

INTRODUCTION	3
How to Use This Document	4
Community Planning Context	6
Process Overview	8
Existing Conditions	10
Campus History	14

CAMPUS DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES 17

Community + Public Benefits	18
Connectivity + Accessibility	20
Recreation + Open Space	22
History + Reuse	24
Development Scenarios	26

DEVELOPMENT APPROACHES		
Creating Long-Term Affordability	30	
Promoting Shared Ownership	30	
Mixing Uses	31	
Sustainable Development Practices	32	
Potential Funding Sources	34	

APPENDIX37Community Values Survey Results38Community Values Survey40Affinity Group Feedback44





INTRODUCTION

The redevelopment of the Clack Campus is a tremendous opportunity for Lawrenceville. This Clack Campus Development Guidelines document summarizes the community's vision of how the campus could be redeveloped while still continuing to play a valuable role as a public resource, far into the future.

In many planning projects, communities are asked to prioritize their development goals, often pitting housing affordability against environmental performance or historic preservation, for example. Going into this planning process, Lawrenceville community members recognized that development guidelines for the Clack Campus should insist on achieving positive outcomes on all fronts. Historic preservation, quality design, and affordable housing should all be prioritized when the site is redeveloped.

This introductory section provides a general overview of the Clack Campus site and buildings. A physical and contextual description of the site is provided, along with basic information about how to use this document, the process through which these guidelines were developed, and a description of some of the regulatory frameworks that would be relevant to any site redevelopment effort.

The following sections of this report build on this overview, and translate the information collected during the participatory-planning process into recommended campus development guidelines and approaches. A set of possible alternative futures for the Clack Campus is presented - all shaped by community voices.

How to Use the Guidelines

This study was motivated by the unique opportunity to set redevelopment standards for the Clack Campus site before the property transfers from Allegheny County to new owners - to private developers, or to another public use or entity.

Lawrenceville Corporation and Lawrenceville United created this guide to equip our organizations, Allegheny County Economic Development (ACED), real estate developers, and the community of Lawrenceville with tools to help achieve the best possible future for the site. The community's needs, priorities, and expectations are outlined clearly, in terms of what they can support as part of any redevelopment proposal. This document will inform and guide the community's orientation, engagement, and response to any future work and development at the site. It is our hope that ACED, and any interested developer, centers these values and guidelines when approaching the disposition and redevelopment of the Clack Campus.

We embarked on this community planning process intending that these Development Guidelines would be used by a wide range of community stakeholders, in the following ways:

Lawrenceville Corporation and Lawrenceville United

Driven by the Lawrenceville community, Lawrenceville Corporation (LC) is a community development nonprofit that acts as a catalyst and conduit for responsible and sustainable growth in the neighborhood. Lawrenceville United (LU) works to improve and protect the quality of life of all Lawrenceville residents. Together, our organizations work to understand and promote the community's vision for the neighborhood through informed conversations and planning, a community process that vets incoming development projects, and programming that support residents and the business district.

This document is yet another tool that our community organizations can use to guide our conversations and involvement in the redevelopment of the Clack Campus. Externally, our organizations will use the guidelines for advocacy to build a shared understanding and consensus among partner organizations, elected officials, and the general community around what types of uses, massing, and design should be prioritized at this site. Internally, the document will inform our policies and positions toward future development near and on the site. As proposals are made available, LC and LU will use this document to understand and assess their alignment with the community's vision and priorities, and respond appropriately.

Allegheny County Economic Development

The Clack Campus is publicly-owned by Allegheny County, and as the county's lead economic and development agency, ACED would facilitate and set the terms for selling the property. ACED could also bring resources to the table to support the site's redevelopment. ACED has a tremendous opportunity, and responsibility, to direct and influence the site's future in a way that is community-minded, reflecting and responding to public needs. ACED should use this document as both a guide and a tool for measuring how well individual proposals comply with these development guidelines.

Before initiating a disposition process for the Clack Campus, ACED should explore alternative ways to intentionally facilitate community-aligned development on the site. Options could include retaining and redeveloping the site under county ownership, or transferring it to the City of Pittsburgh or another public entity. If ACED does release a Request for Development Proposals, these guidelines should inform a set of requirements and restrictions that will ensure alignment with the community's vision. ACED should make it clear from the outset that proposed development projects that align with the community's vision and adhere to the guidelines set forth here are more likely to receive support as part of the proposal selection process. Eligible proposals should be evaluated in partnership with the community, using the values and visions outlined in this document as criteria for selection.

Developers and Property Owners

This document articulates the community's expectations for redeveloping the Clack Campus. The Campus Development Guidelines (page 17) should be used as a checklist of requirements throughout the pre-development, design, and development process. Applying the community-generated design principles from the start of a project will help to ensure a high quality of design and minimize unnecessary project delays due to community concerns.

While these guidelines will inform future redevelopment plans for the Clack Campus, active communication and partnership with the community and neighborhood organizations will be essential throughout the development process. Before assembling a proposal or pursuing redevelopment, developers interested in the site should carefully review and consider the values and guidelines to determine whether they are willing to facilitate and maintain the level of community partnership that will be required. A proposed development project that aligns with the community's vision and adheres to the guidelines will likely receive public

support for zoning variance requests, thereby enabling the developer to earn a greater return on their investment.

Community Partners

Partner organizations can use this document to learn about the community's vision for the Clack Campus, and use it as a resource to hold ACED and developers accountable to delivering tangible, resident-serving benefits. Partners can also use this as a reference document, helping to establish a common language and shared set of principles to use when speaking with city officials and developers.

The Lawrenceville Community and General Public

This document is a result of the belief that the community has the highest stake in our own future, that we deserve to be at the table from the beginning of planning and development processes that impact our neighborhood, and that our values and vision cannot be an after-thought, especially when planning for a publicly-owned asset.

To quote James Charlton, an American author and disability rights activist, the phrase "nothing about us without us" expresses the conviction that we who are most impacted by the redevelopment of this site know what is best for us and our community. Our collective power is only amplified when we work together. This document will thus serve as a rallying tool, uniting us around a common vision and making it clear to anyone with a vested interest in the Clack Campus that our vision must be at the front and center of all decision processes.

For more information about how to influence the development process, visit [insert website link].

The general public can use these guidelines to learn how to influence development through the City of Pittsburgh's planning and zoning processes. Zoning variance requests are often made to obtain permission to increase building heights or reduce setback requirements, thereby enabling developers to earn a greater return on their investment. The variance process is an important mechanism that residents should use to advocate for community benefits, and for high-quality, sustainable, and equitable development.

Lawrenceville community members should also work closely with Lawrenceville Corporation, which has a standard process for convening and facilitating constructive conversations between residents, other stakeholders, developers and City departments.



In 2019, close to 50 Lawrenceville residents and community partners packed the hearing room, at a City of Pittsburgh Planning Commission meeting, to support requirements to create housing opportunities for everyone.



As part of the Clack Campus planning outreach effort, LC and LU hosted an engagement opportunity on Butler Street at a Lawrenceville Pop-Up Market. The public was invited to stop by, respond to a few different possible development scenarios, and build their dream site.



Lawrenceville community members are dedicated to making the neighborhood more green and sustainable. This is a photo of volunteers for a Fall 2021 TreeVitalize street tree planting event starting at Arsenal Park.

COMMUNITY PLANNING CONTEXT

Situated in a prime location in Lower Lawrenceville, the Clack Campus is comprised of a unique group of notable buildings set within a green and open landscape. With its mature trees, stone site wall and generous building setbacks, the open campus contrasts with its densely-built surroundings. Fronting onto important regional corridors, the site benefits from excellent access for pedestrians, vehicular traffic, and public transportation riders, alike. There are noteworthy views into the site, and expansive views of the surrounding city landscape from the site and main campus building.

Lawrenceville has been experiencing more than a decade of intense real estate investment, with building renovations and property redevelopment throughout the neighborhood, with no sign of slowing down. Earnings and benefits resulting from this change have largely been realized by a handful of individuals and developers, while Black and other longtime residents, senior citizens, and young families find it increasingly difficult to find safe, affordable housing in Lawrenceville.

Due to its high visibility, notable architecture and legacy as a public site with community-oriented uses, the Clack Campus is viewed by many as perhaps one of the most important opportunities to re-envision a neighborhood site in a way that acknowledges, responds to, and builds upon community needs. At present, this pivotal and historic site is rendered almost totally inaccessible to the public. When it comes time to be redeveloped, the Lawrenceville community wants the campus to be accessible, with a mix of uses that meet residents' needs and raise the bar for neighborhood development practices.

This document should be used to guide the process of redeveloping the Clack Campus. This document testifies to a desire for responsible, community-serving and sustainable development. The Clack Campus must be preserved as a public asset. Parties pursuing projects for the Clack Campus should use this document as a resource when creating redevelopment proposals and plans. Community stakeholders should use this document to communicate their shared vision and leverage a future for the site that continues to provide public benefits.

Lawrenceville community members are deeply committed to advocating for high-quality development projects. For larger projects, advocacy is often supported by Lawrenceville Corporation and Lawrenceville United, the organizations that led the creation of this guidelines document. There is also a robust legacy of local neighborhood planning. Several prior community plans and initiatives are relevant to the future redevelopment of the Clack Campus.



The Clack Campus is located within the heart of the Penn-Main District, as described in the 2005 Lawrenceville Community Plan. Image: Pfaffmann+Associates



The 2015 Arsenal Park Master Plan recommends restoring a public connection from Arsenal Park, through the Clack Campus, to Penn Avenue. Image: MKSK



Phase I of renovations to Arsenal Park start in the spring/summer of 2022. Planning for the portion of the park near Clack Campus will also begin this year. Image: Pashek + MTR from engage.pittsburghpa.gov

Lawrenceville Community Plan (2005)

This neighborhood-wide master plan identifies community design goals and revitalization opportunities. While the plan creates guidelines for development and parcels along Penn Avenue, directly abutting the Clack Campus, the plan assumed that the campus would remain as Allegheny County offices. It limits recommendations to improving and maintaining existing campus green spaces.

Penn Ave Master Plan (2008)

This is a comprehensive urban design plan for the Penn Avenue Corridor combined with commercial and residential market analyses. While it did not envision the possibility of redeveloping the Clack Campus, it emphasized its significance in the community as one of the only semi-public open spaces along Penn Avenue. Recommendations included: providing a connection through the campus to Arsenal Park; expanding Arsenal Park's boundaries; establishing the Penn Avenue / 40th Street intersection as a neighborhood gateway; maintaining Clack Campus' existing, mature tree canopy and filling in the tree line on Penn Avenue; providing bus shelters and other mobility improvements on Penn, 40th and 39th Streets; and redeveloping the broader institutional area with high-density residential and office space.

Arsenal Park Master Plan Update (2015-Current)

Arsenal Park is contiguous with the northern edge of the Clack Campus. In 2015 an extensive, community-initiated public planning process was held to create a vision for improving the park. While the Clack Campus was not officially part of the project's scope, the plan recommend restoring a public connection from Arsenal Park, through the campus, to Penn Avenue. The connection is reflected in this document. The Master Plan is now going through a city-led update and implementation, with planning for the park area abutting the Clack Campus to begin in 2022.

Herron Avenue Station Planning (2021-)

Port Authority of Allegheny County is leading this study to explore the use of the Transit Revitalization Investment District (TRID) financing mechanism to catalyze equitable transitoriented development within a three-quarter mile radius of Herron Station, as well as the public infrastructure improvements necessary to facilitate access to transit within the study area, creating affordable, reliable and more-equitable mobility modes.

Affordable Housing (Ongoing)

Displacement caused by housing price pressure is a top concern for Lawrenceville and adjacent neighborhoods and has been affirmed by various regional and local studies, plans, and



In the last decade, a total of 10 affordable housing units have been created in Lawrenceville by the first CLT in western Pennsylvania. Image: lvpgh.com/the-lawrenceville-community-land-trust/



Sixth Ward Flats is a two-building, 35-unit new construction affordable housing project located in Lawrenceville. The project was built on two of the last remaining vacant parcels in Doughboy Square, a highly-visible gateway to the neighborhood. Photo: Action Housing

community dialogues. LU and LC have focused on this priority since 2012, and some of the work accomplished includes:

- Creating the Lawrenceville Community Land Trust (CLT) and providing 13 permanently-affordable, single-family houses. The CLT now serves a regional base as the City of Bridges Community Land Trust.
- Partnering with ACTION-Housing to develop 35 affordable rental units at the Sixth Ward Flats at Doughboy Square.
 8 units have a stated preference as homes for people with disabilities The development opened in January of 2022.
- Advocating for Inclusionary Zoning (IZ) legislation. Pittsburgh's first IZ overlay district was permanently adopted in Lawrenceville, in 2021, after a two-year pilot period. The district requires new construction and renovation projects, with 20 or more units, to price 10% of those units at a rate that is considered to be affordable.

PROCESS OVERVIEW

Jan. 2021	April	June & July	Sept. & Oct.	Nov.	Feb. 2022	Future
County engages LC & LU	Values	Development Scenarios Workshops	Affinity Group Meetings	•		Community Development Review

Project Time Line

The Clack Campus Development Guidelines were developed from a series of interactive workshops, surveys, and meetings conducted during the spring, summer and fall of 2021. The public process was facilitated by the project team and consultants, and guided by the steering committee.

Due to ongoing public health concerns surrounding the COVID-19 pandemic, the community engagement process was designed to ensure that everyone participating would be safe. Public workshops were held either virtually, or outdoors. In-person meeting participants wore face coverings and adhered to social distancing guidelines. Workshop materials and activities were designed to minimize physical contact.

Community Values Workshops

The initial round of virtual workshops, held in April of 2021, focused on establishing a set of shared community values for the site. Conducted via Zoom, these interactive and conversational meetings were based on the "*Place It!*" process created by planner James Rojas. Nearly 70 participants discussed community values and potential futures for the Clack Campus. In facilitated breakout rooms of three to four people, participants were asked to use household items within their physical reach to create abstract dioramas representing their vision of how the Clack Campus could be redeveloped to serve community needs. Meeting facilitators documented each model and took detailed notes.

Online Community Values Survey

Ideas presented during the first round of workshops were summarized and distilled into a preliminary set of community values and goals reflecting participants' vision for a future Clack Campus. These values were further vetted through an interactive online survey, which remained open for the duration of the guidelines development process. Survey participants reviewed and expanded upon the community values summary. To help ensure that the respondent pool reflected the diversity of the community at large, demographic information was collected and analyzed. See the Appendix for a summary of survey responses.



During virtual, Zoom-based engagement sessions, participants shared household objects and homemade models to represent their personal experiences and memories of living in Lawrenceville, and to explore possible uses that could be included when the Clack Campus is redeveloped.



A model created and documented by planning process participants. These abstract dioramas were documented by the Project Team to help inform the preliminary community values that were developed for the Clack Campus.

.....

Development Scenarios Workshops

A second round of in-person workshops were conducted in June and July to explore potential building massing and layout alternatives, and solicit opinions about future, possible uses for a reimagined Clack Campus. During the hands-on workshops, participants used physical building blocks as a tool for creating modeling potential development scenarios, including thoughts about buildings and open spaces. Community members added flags to the models to identify the uses that they would like to see at the Clack Campus. All of the models were documented and used as the basis for developing alternative approaches to density, open space and preferred uses for the site.

Affinity Group Meetings

In addition to the public workshops, LC and LU conducted a series of affinity group meetings to help ensure that the Clack Campus planning process included the voices of marginalized populations, particularly those who have historically been less represented in past planning processes, and people who have been disproportionately impacted by redevelopment projects in and around Lawrenceville. Some of these groups were identified by community members, during the public workshops, as target populations that the future development could serve. LC and LU staff reached out directly to these affinity groups, engaging them in a more focused set of workshops, and focusing their voices and expertise on how the future, redeveloped Clack Campus could best serve them. Affinity groups included:

- Seniors
- People with Disabilities
- Displaced Residents, with a focus on Black residents
- Immigrants & Refugees
- Families, with a focus on single moms

The campus development guidelines included in this document are based on the community values and goals articulated during this participatory planning process, expressing views about topics including public benefits, physical accessibility, future uses, open space, density, and building reuse. A summary of affinity group feedback is provided in the Appendix of this document.



Each participant identified a preferred development scenario.



Presentation boards at Arsenal Park displayed the preliminary set of values and priorities developed during Community Workshop #1.



Participants modeled potential development scenarios, and include new use "flags" to describe how the buildings and open space could be utilized.

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The Clack Campus Site

The 6.5-acre Clack Campus faces onto Penn Avenue in Pittsburgh's Lawrenceville neighborhood. The site is adjacent to Arsenal Park, the neighborhood's primary park space. The surrounding neighborhood is predominantly composed of brick row houses and three-story, mixed-use buildings with storefronts. Butler Street, located just north of the park, is Lawrenceville's main commercial district, with a mix of retail, restaurants and services. The Clack site contains eight structures, parking lots and open spaces organized in a campus arrangement. Three of the largest buildings front onto active neighborhood streets, while several buildings are organized around an interior open space that once connected directly to Arsenal Park. The Clack Campus has been a public facility since the early 19th century, when the site was part of the US Arsenal, a parcel that stretched all the way northward to the Allegheny River. The majority of the buildings date from the site's subsequent use as a US Marine Hospital. The Campus now houses several Allegheny County facilities.



The Clack Campus is bounded by busy roadways: Penn Avenue, 39th and 40th Streets. Arsenal Park forms the Campus' northern border, but the parcels are currently separated by a fence.



The Clack Campus is set within a densely-built neighborhood context.



The former Marine Hospital building as viewed from Penn Avenue.



View of the Clack Campus from 40th Street.



View from within the Campus.



View of the Campus from Arsenal Park.



View towards Downtown Pittsburgh from within the campus.



View of the campus from along 39th Street.

.....

EXISTING CONDITIONS



The Clack Campus Buildings

The eight Clack Campus buildings were developed between the years 1840 and 2009. The buildings vary in terms of structural soundness and occupiable condition. Some renovations have been done over time, but the original, exterior character of most buildings has been maintained. Buildings are referred to, in this document, by the following numbers. Buildings' original and most recent uses, as well as the approximate date of construction, are listed below:

- 1. Marine Hospital now office space, but mainly vacant
- 2. Powder Magazine now the facilities maintenance shop
- 3. Officer-in-Charge Residence now offices
- 4. Junior Officers Quarters now storage
- 5. Nurses' Quarters now offices
- 6. Gun Magazine now storage, deliveries and offices

- 7. Hospital Attendants Quarters now offices
- 8. Public Health Laboratory laboratory



.....

Front entrance to the Marine Hospital (building #1).



Interior of the Marine Hospital Building's light-filled rooms (building #1)



View from Penn Avenue of the Powder Magazine (building #2)



Vaulted ceilings within the Powder Magazine (building #2).

Zoning Considerations

The Clack Campus parcel, zoned as part of a Local Neighborhood Commercial (LNC) District, is contiguous with the Penn Avenue corridor. LNC districts are intended to:

- Maintain a small scale and rich diversity of neighborhood-serving commercial districts;
- 2. Promote and enhance the quality of life of adjacent residential areas; and,
- Reduce the adverse impacts that are sometimes associated with commercial uses in order to promote compatibility with residential development.

The Pittsburgh Zoning Code sets the following development standards for LNC Districts:

- Maximum Floor Ratio (FAR): 2:1
- Maximum Height: 45', not to exceed 3 stories
- Minimum Setbacks: 0
- Maximum Lot Coverage: 90%

LNC Districts are intended to be mixed-use and therefore a wide range of uses are allowed by right, or through an exception. More information on allowable uses and development standards can be found in the City of Pittsburgh's Zoning Ordinance.

Requests for height, use and other variances are possible through a Zoning Board of Adjustment (ZBA) process that requires public comment and input. The existing campus buildings generally conform with the current zoning code, but the existing campus has a significantly lower lot coverage than the maximum allowed, and the existing setbacks on all street edges are at least 25'.

The Clack Campus is located within the nationally-recognized Lawrenceville Historic District, which opens up opportunities for accessing tax credit funding to help pay for historicallysensitive building renovations.

The Campus is also located within a City of Pittsburgh Inclusionary Zoning (IZ) overlay district, establishing a minimum number of affordable units to be included in new, larger-scale, multi-unit residential development projects within the overlay district boundaries. Development projects meeting the IZ requirements are automatically eligible for tax abatements through the City of Pittsburgh.

This document sets forth an additional set of considerations, beyond those outlined by Zoning ordinances, that are intended to help preserve the campus character of the site, and promote future uses that meet the needs of the community.

CAMPUS HISTORY

Pre-Colonial to Present-Day

When Europeans arrived in Pittsburgh, Native Americans were already living there. Shannopin's Town was a Delaware settlement, established as early as 1730, spanning from presentday Penn Avenue to the Allegheny River, north of 30th Street.

Lawrenceville Borough was incorporated in 1814, by Colonel William Foster, the father of Pittsburgh composer Stephen Foster. In 1814, Colonel Foster sold the 30-acre site - bounded by 39th Street, 40th Street, Penn Avenue and the Allegheny Riverfront, and spanning across Butler Street - to the U.S. government. The Allegheny Arsenal was established on the parcel by the U.S. Army Ordnance Department. Work to design and build the Arsenal began that year, and a first group of buildings with the signature, surrounding stone wall and gates was completed by 1820. Allegheny Arsenal was in military service through the Civil War (1861-1865). Lawrenceville was annexed to the City of Pittsburgh in 1868. The property was subdivided and sold as two discrete parts, bisected by Butler Street. Heinz acquired the northern portion, while the City of Pittsburgh acquired the southern half, to be used as open recreation space within the dense neighborhood growing up around it.

In 1904, the property was transferred to establish the U.S. Marine Hospital. When the Marine Hospital ceased operations, in 1949, the property was leased to the City. Ownership eventually transferred to Allegheny County which continues to hold the property. The County Health Department was established and was rededicated as the Frank B. Clack Health Center, in 1979, to honor a former Health Department Director.

The southern part of the original Allegheny Arsenal parcel is currently home to Arsenal Elementary and Middle Schools, Arsenal Park, and the buildings and landscape comprising the County Health Department headquarters. The campus has evolved over time, with the construction of additional buildings, facility parking lots, building upgrades, and the installation of a fence between Arsenal Park and the Health Department property.

A Public Presence: Looking to the Past + Future

Numerous physical and cultural aspects are notable about the Clack Campus, starting with the property's military use as part of a United States arsenal. The items described here reflect only a few highlights. The arsenal itself was laid out by Benjamin Latrobe, a famous and prolific American architect. The agency that became the National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (OSHA) originated at the Pittsburgh Marine Hospital. Arsenal Health Center was established, where early childhood pioneers - Benjamin Spock and Fred McFeely Rogers - actively worked, did research and ran community-serving programs. Many visionary, progressive, public functions and activities were centered at the Clack Campus property over the years. During the Clack Facility Public Planning Process - the foundation for this guidelines document - community members expressed a strong interest in preserving and building upon that legacy in the future, as the site is redeveloped.



Early 20th Century postcard of the United States Marine Hospital. Source: wikipedia.org.



1872 map of the site as part of the United States Allegheny Arsenal, showing the gun powder and gun magazine buildings, which still stand today. From the *Arsenal Park Master Plan* (2015) by MKSK.



1937 map of the site as the U.S. Marine Hospital complex showing five new buildings configured around open space, connected by walking paths and a carriage roundabout, creating a campus feeling. From the *Arsenal Park Master Plan* (2015) by MKSK.

Redevelopment Opportunities & Protections

Historic designations can be confusing even to experienced building owners, stakeholders, developers, and designers. Historic designation isn't intended to prevent a private property owner from doing what they want with their building, or from making changes to a structure. Rather, historic designation is intended to protect and aid in the preservation of our shared cultural heritage and ensure that projects are done with sensitivity and care, and with the future in mind.

Clack Campus is located within the Lawrenceville Historic District, which was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 2019. Both its buildings and site elements are contributing structures within the larger district. Because of this status, a private developer could apply to access Federal and State Tax Credits to help with project costs. Using preservation tax credits would trigger federal- and state-level regulatory review, and projects must both adhere to the U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and successfully go through proper reviews and processes. The essence of the Standards is simple: try to fix buildings before replacing them, and if you replace materials, use exactly-matching or compatible materials. The tax credit technical review process takes into account building interiors and exteriors, as well as site work. Tax credits could be used for the Clack Campus redevelopment, enabling higher-quality construction materials to be used, helping to make housing units more affordable to community members, etc.

The entire Allegheny Arsenal, including the Clack Campus, is also individually listed as a historically-significant landmark by the City of Pittsburgh (est. 1977). Any modifications to buildings' exterior, new construction, or the proposed demolition of structures on the site would be reviewed by the City's Historic Review Commission (HRC). The HRC would review the site as an historic campus, complete with landscape and structures. General considerations would include the association and organization of buildings with one another, as well as the landscape design and hillsides, any external changes to structures on the site, or new proposed elements. The Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation would guide the approaches, methods and specifications used for proposed work. HRC only looks at exterior changes - the stone wall, exterior alterations to buildings, paved surfaces, lighting, etc. HRC does not review building interiors. Any additions or new structures would be required to be compatible with the existing campus character.



1940 view of the Clack Campus showing the shared property line with Arsenal Park to the north (bottom of photo). From the *Arsenal Park Master Plan* (2015) by MKSK.



2021 view of the Clack Campus showing the expansion of surface parking lots, the addition to Building #7 along 39th Street, and the new Laboratory Building (Building #8). Source: Google Maps.

References

The Principle Indian towns of Western Pennsylvania. by C. Hale Sipe. journals.psu.edu/wph/article/viewFile/1516/1364

U.S. Allegheny Arsenal, Fortieth, Thirty-Ninth & Butler Streets, Penn Avenue, Pittsburgh, Allegheny County, PA. Part of the Historic American Building Survey. Prepared by Charles M. Stotz (reviewed 1936)

Library of Congress: https://loc.gov/pictures/item/pa0074/

U.S. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. www.nps.gov/tps/standards/rehabilitation/rehab/stand.htm

Wikipedia: en.wikipedia.org





CAMPUS DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES

The development guidelines are organized into four broad categories. Each category begins with a set of community values that emerged from the participatory planning process.

The values and goals for the campus are further elaborated with a set of quantifiable design guidelines and precedent examples drawn from Pittsburgh and the wider world. The guidelines articulate design goals and list uses that will best serve community needs in the future.

This section also includes four hypothetical development scenarios that follow the guidelines and include a rough estimate of sizing capacity for potential spaces and uses on the site.

1. COMMUNITY + PUBLIC BENEFITS

COMMUNITY VALUE

Support people, diversity, and quality of life in Lawrenceville.

Goals:

- Safe, inclusive and welcoming community uses: arts, recreation, health care, senior services, child care, adult education, etc.
- Affordable housing to support a broad range of incomes and household types
- Affordable small commercial spaces
- Uses that support Lawrenceville's most marginalized residents including BIPOC, singleparents with children, immigrant/refugees, lowincome, people with disabilities, older adults
- Development approaches that support shared ownership

CAMPUS GUIDELINES

1 Community + Public Benefits

- 1.1 Include a mix of affordable housing unit types and sizes, potentially including housing intended specifically for families, seniors, and people with disabilities.
- 1.2 Designate 40% of all residential units for affordable housing, inclusive of the 10% inclusionary zoning requirement.
- 1.3 Ensure that all buildings and residential units are visitable by people with limited mobility (Type C), and that 5% of residential units are fully accessible (Type A).
- 1.4 Height variances above 3 stories will be considered for projects that incorporate multiple elements from "Development Approaches" (see page 30).
- 1.5 Integrate multiple small-scale and affordable commercial spaces no larger than 2,400 SF to accommodate community and cultural uses, as well as diverse local businesses.



As Lawrenceville's real estate market transformed in the last fifteen years, housing and commercial space became more expensive. The publicly-owned Clack Campus, located in the heart of the neighborhood, has the potential to meet a variety of community needs as Lawrenceville continues to evolve.





Height variances will only be supported for projects with a strong commitment to affordability

COMMUNITY + PUBLIC BENEFITS EXAMPLES



Childcare / Early Education Spaces Catholic Youth Association Daycare in Lawrenceville Photo Credit: Catholic Youth Association



Community Arts Spaces Blackhorse Workshop pubic access maker space in London. Photo Credit: Assemble Architects (Ben Quinton)



Mixed Income Cooperative Housing Spreefeld cooperative housing and public gardens in Berlin. Photo credit: FAT Koehl Architekten (Thomas Bruns)



Multigenerational Cohousing La Borda cooperative housing and communal kitchen in Barcelona. Photo credit: - Lacol Architects - World Habitat Awards



Supportive Affordable Rental Housing Penn Mathilda affordable, rental apartments for veterans in Bloomfield. Photo credit: Moss Architects



Small Affordable Commercial Spaces Small commercial space in Pittsburgh's Bloomfield neighborhood. Photo credit: Azorean Cafe

.....

2. CONNECTIVITY + ACCESSIBILITY

COMMUNITY VALUE

Expand neighborhood public space, and mitigate the impact of traffic.

Goals:

- . Publicly-accessible open space that is an extension of Arsenal Park
- Gentle, accessible pedestrian connections through the campus
- Uses that complement and activate Arsenal • Park
- Priority access by walking, cycling and transit
- Parking shielded from public space



Arsenal Park's 2015 Master Plan recommends a new connection from the park through the Clack Campus to Penn Avenue.

SITE GUIDELINES

2. Connectivity + Accessibility

- 2.1 Create new, accessible, pedestrian connections through the Clack Campus between Arsenal Park, Penn Avenue, 39th and 40th Streets. At a minimum, create a central, 12-ft wide, ADA-accessible, public pedestrian path linking Penn Avenue to Arsenal Park between buildings 1 and 2.
- 2.2 Prioritize access by walking, cycling and transit with a Transportation Demand Management Plan.
- 2.3 Shield any parking from the street, park edges and pedestrian paths.



CONNECTIVITY + ACCESSIBILITY EXAMPLES



New Accessible Connections Gentle connections in Los Angeles' Grand Park. Photo Credit: Rios Architects



Extension of Arsenal Park Looking towards Clack Campus from Arsenal Park. Photo Credit: Studio for Spatial Practice



Public Open Spaces Bryant Park in New York City. Photo credit: Olin Landscape Architects



Pedestrian, Bike and Transit Friendly Multiuse trails integrated into Corktown Common park in Toronto. Photo credit: - Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates



Complementary Uses Facing Arsenal Park OTB Bicycle Café at the North Park Boathouse, in Allison Park, PA. Photo credit: Tribune Review (Phlip G. Pavely)



Integrated Convertible Structured Parking

A planed all-timber parking structure designed to integrate plantings, a rooftop garden and potentially convert to other uses. Image credit: Open Platform and JAJA Architects

.

3. RECREATION + OPEN SPACE

COMMUNITY VALUE

Preserve the campus character of the site and enhance Lawrenceville's ecological sustainability and recreational offerings.

Goals:

- New recreational spaces to complement Arsenal Park
- Maintained tree canopy and ecologically rich landscapes
- Community gardens
- Outdoor community event spaces
- Public space for pets
- Improved stormwater management



The Clack Campus and adjacent Arsenal Park form a green oasis between Lower and Central Lawrenceville. Any future development should preserve the campus character of the site and enhance the existing open space.

CAMPUS GUIDELINES

3. Recreation + Open Space

- 3.1 Reestablish a connection between Clack Campus and Arsenal Park, and preserve the campus character of the site by not exceeding a maximum of 40% total lot coverage. A majority of the site open space should be accessible to the public.
- 3.2 Maintain at least a 25-ft setback along the street edges to preserve and respect the green campus character, mature tree canopy, and historic Arsenal wall.
- 3.3 Preserve and protect at least 90% of the existing tree canopy on the site and use International Society of Arboriculture best management practices for tree preservation during construction. Replace any tree removed inch for inch as measured by caliper.



RECREATION + OPEN SPACE EXAMPLES



An Open Green Campus Cornell Tech Campus in New York City. Photo Credit: James Corner Field Operations



Community Food Gardens Ballfield Community Farm in Perry Hilltop Photo credit: Grow Pittsburgh



Maintained Tree Canopy + Ecological Landscapes

Native plantings at Lawrenceville's Tree Park. Photo Credit: Studio for Spatial Practice



Community Event Space Terraced event space at the Akron Art Museum. Photo credit: - OLIN Landscape Architects



Dedicated Farmers Market Space Falls Park Farmers Market in Sioux Falls. Photo credit: Sioux Falls Business



Public Spaces for Pets Seger Dog Park in Philadelphia. Image credit: SPDOA (WoosterThorpe)

4. HISTORY + REUSE

COMMUNITY VALUE

Celebrate the historical significance of the campus and bring new life to its buildings.

Goals:

- Reuse and renovation of the most important historic buildings
- Celebration of Arsenal and Lawrenceville history
- Publicly accessible uses in historic buildings
- New buildings that complement and do not overwhelm historic structures



A second-story room of the Marine Hospital, built in 1908. Photo Credit: Studio for Spatial Practice

CAMPUS GUIDELINES

4. History + Reuse

- 4.1 Renovate, reuse, and incorporate publicly accessible uses in Buildings 1, 2, and 6. If possible, renovate and reuse buildings 5 and 7.
- 4.2 Bias any new taller buildings to the middle of the site, and do not exceed the height of the Marine Hospital building roof with any new building.



HISTORY + REUSE EXAMPLES



Creative Renovation of Unique Spaces Museum Lab created by the Children's Museum of Pittsburgh. Photo Credit: Koning Eizenberg Architecture (Eric Staudenmaier)



Publicly Accessible Uses in Historic Buildings

Transformation of an historic H.H. Richardson building into a hotel in Buffalo, NY. Photo credit: Deborah Berke Partners / National Trust for Historic Preservation



Creative Integration of Old and New Elements

A new building connects a 19th century post office with the 1939 Buhl Planetarium, at the Children's Museum of Pittsburgh. Photo Credit: Koning Eizenberg Architecture (Albert Vecerka/Esto)



Adaptive Reuse of Historic Arsenal Structures Renovated Deptford Market Yard railway arches in London. Photo Credit: U + I Group, Pollard Thomas Edwards Architects



Sustainable Renovation of Existing Buildings Office spaces at the renovated Revolution Mill in Greensboro, NC. Photo credit: - Kane Realty / G Edwin Belk Architects



New Buildings that Don't Overwhelm Historic Ones

A new connector element at the Montcrest School in Toronto. Photo credit: Montgomery Sisam Architects (Younes Bounhar)

.

DEVELOPMENT SCENARIOS

The following scenarios illustrate four preliminary redevelopment concepts that would repurpose and reuse many of the existing Clack Campus buildings. Three of the scenarios would add new buildings, in accordance with the design guidelines presented in this document. Many other configurations are possible, using the design guidelines. Community members participating in the workshops tended to initially prefer the lower density scenarios one and two, but after prompting about potential uses for affordable housing and other community priorities, were

ONE: ADAPTIVE REUSE FOCUS

A scenario focused on the adaptive reuse of existing buildings. One new building, at Penn Avenue and 39th Street, consolidates site parking within a structured garage with small commercial uses.

Provide up to 75 units of Housing

@ 40% affordable: 30 units

May include 8-10 ground floor Community or Limited Commercial uses (up to 20,000 SF)

Some upper floors could also be Office Space (50,000 SF or more)

Provide integrated, structured parking

more receptive to the higher density scenario three. The highest-density scenario, number four, illustrates the capacity to maintain and reuse both the high- and medium-priority historic buildings, while adding substantial new construction to the site. All four scenarios assume eliminating surface parking lots and integrating required parking into central garages below new buildings. The scenarios also illustrate the possibility of extending new, accessible open space into the campus, connecting directly to Arsenal Park and accommodating public passage through the site in all directions.



TWO: LIMITED NEW CONSTRUCTION

A housing-focused scenario that keeps the majority of buildings with a new, mixed-use building, at Penn Avenue and 39th Street, including integrated, structured parking.

Renovate buildings 1, 2, 3. 4, 5, 6 & 7

Demolish building 8

Create new public open spaces

Provide up to 150 units of Housing

@ 40% affordable: 60 units

May include 8-10 ground floor Community uses or Limited Commercial uses (up to 20,000 SF)

Some upper floors could also be Office Space (50,000 SF or more)

Provide integrated, structured parking



THREE: MIXED-USE FOCUS

A scenario that transforms the center of the site, with two new mixed-use buildings including integrated parking.

Renovate buildings 1, 2, 5, 6 & 7

Demolish buildings 3, 4 & 8

Create new public open spaces

Provide up to 220 units of Housing

@ 40% affordable: 88 units

May include 8-10 ground floor Community or Limited Commercial uses (up to 20,000 SF)

Some upper floors could also be Office Space (50,000 SF or more)

Provide integrated, structured parking

FOUR: DENSIFIED CAMPUS

A scenario that keeps the majority of buildings, with a new mixed-use building at Penn Avenue and 39th Street, including integrated, structured parking.

Renovate buildings 1, 2, 5, 6 & 7

Demolish buildings 3, 4 & 8

Create new public open spaces

Provide up to 275 units of Housing

@ 40% affordable - 110 units

May include 10-12 ground floor Community or Limited Retail uses (up to 25,000 SF)

Some upper floors could also be Office Space (50,000 SF or more)

Provide integrated, structured parking









DEVELOPMENT APPROACHES

A development approach is a way to strategically frame or conceive of a project so that design and economic decisions are guided by an over-arching goal or priority. This way of working helps to ensure that the ultimate project is thoughtful and coherent and meets a wide range of community needs.

The development approaches presented in this section are by no means all-encompassing, and there are certainly other ways to redevelop the Clack Campus. Ideally, several approaches would be combined to create a creative, holistic and inclusive development vision for the site. The final section on potential funding sources details a variety of possible ways to subsidize a complex mixed-use development.

Lawrenceville is ready for a redevelopment project that raises the bar for what is possible, and that is guided by robust community input. The Clack Campus parcel has been publicly-owned for more than 200 years. It is a unique opportunity to introduce development approaches that create lasting benefits for current and future Lawrenceville residents.

CREATING LONG-TERM AFFORDABILITY

Creating affordable, community-serving space is a goal for the Clack Campus and other major development sites in Lawrenceville. This could include affordable housing intended for both rental and homeownership, as well as commercial spaces intended for small local businesses. Spaces should be developed using financing and ownership models that support long-term or permanent affordability. In the Lower Lawrenceville census tract where the Clack Campus sits, 22% of households spent over 30% of their household income on housing costs in 2020, and 17% of households earned less than \$25,000 a year. , To help increase the supply, at least 40% of all residential units developed on the Clack Campus should be designated for affordable housing, inclusive of the 10% required by inclusionary zoning. A variety of funding sources for affordable housing are discussed on page 32. The current Area Median Income (AMI) thresholds for the Pittsburgh region can be found on the URA <u>website</u>.

Larger Affordable Units

Any new affordable housing should include a variety of residential unit sizes to help residents to remain in the community as their households evolve. Many families that once called Lawrenceville home have been displaced in the past decade, while new families find it increasingly difficult to find safe, affordable housing in the neighborhood. As a result, the community has continually voiced a desire for more affordable housing suitable for families, both in past housing discussions and during this community process. A range of unit sizes from one to four bedrooms is desirable for this site, with a significant percent of affordable units in the three to four bedroom range.

Affordable Rental Housing

Affordable rental housing should prioritize households below 50% AMI and should commit to accepting Housing Choice Vouchers. Affordable units should be indistinguishable from unsubsidized units, and integrated into the larger development. All efforts should be made to ensure that affordability designations are long-term, or preferably, permanent.

Limited Equity Homeownership

If housing units are sold as single-family units, condominiums, or as part of a cooperative, they should include deed restrictions to limit the resale value and ensure that the units remain affordable for subsequent buyers. For-sale units should prioritize households below 80% AMI. A variety of approaches exist for designing a resale formula to account for inflation, homeowner improvements, depreciation or damage. A comparison of approaches can be found <u>here</u>. 3

Community Land Trust Partnerships

One tested approach for guaranteeing long-term affordability is creating a development partnership with a community land trust (CLT) that enforces limited-equity deed restrictions through ownership of the land. Buildings on CLT-owned land can be renovated, developed and sold to private buyers, while the land trust maintains land ownership. Locally, the <u>City of</u> <u>Bridges Community Land Trust</u> could potentially act as such a partner. 4 More information about CLTs can be found <u>here.</u>5

PROMOTING SHARED OWNERSHIP

Development models supporting shared ownership and governance are well suited to meeting multiple goals that emerged from the community process. Many residents voiced a desire for more resident ownership and control paired with a broad range of household incomes. Others sought housing models with deeper and closer connections to supportive family members and neighbors as a way to lessen the burden of childcare, aging-in-place, or establishing independence without limiting access to needed support for those living with disabilities. Shared-ownership models can provide a means of integrating common amenities and including income-generating spaces into a residential building. While less common, many of the affordable housing funding sources listed on page 34 could be applied to a shared-ownership housing model.

Cooperatives

Housing cooperatives, or co-ops, provide an alternative to traditional methods of acquiring a primary residence and building equity. Co-op shareholders buy into a corporation that owns the property, with the exclusive right to use one of the units. Pittsburgh is already home to Belmar Gardens, the nation's first cooperative built with a Federal Housing Administration insured mortgage. Belmar Gardens was purposefully developed to create homeownership and wealth-building opportunities for Black residents facing discrimination. A cooperative can be set up with limited equity deed restrictions, and the cooperative ownership model can also integrate tiers designed for different income levels. Housing cooperatives can also integrate shared amenities and spaces, including potentially leasable commercial spaces. Contemporary European cooperative housing examples often incorporate shared spaces for cooking, eating, socializing and playing. Some projects also mix traditional, single-household apartments with co-living spaces designed for a number of individuals to share living spaces in a "cluster apartment." Some cooperatives also have shared work spaces or spaces that can be rented to tenants providing services to residents, such as

Clack Facility Public Planning Process

day care. The National Association of Housing Cooperatives has more information about developing co-ops here.

Cohousing

Cohousing encourages social interaction, mutual support and a stronger sense of shared ownership and decision making. In contrast to the fully-shared, cooperative ownership model, cohousing combines ownership of a discrete, single-family unit with collective ownership of shared spaces. Typically, cohousing is structured as a condominium or as individual units with a homeowners association. Shared cohousing spaces typically include a common house with a large kitchen and dining area, laundry facilities, gardening and play areas. These spaces are managed and maintained collectively and are typically used for community events. Cohousing communities are typically comprised of 20-40 units, allowing residents to know one another. A majority of cohousing in the United States takes the form of single-family houses, but there are also denser, multifamily buildings. More information can be found here.

MIXING USES

Affordable Commercial Spaces

Projects with commercial spaces in either renovated or new buildings should include affordable spaces for small local businesses. To facilitate the inclusion of existing and future local businesses, small commercial spaces could be managed in collaboration with local community organizations.

Community Support Uses

The Clack Campus buildings have a long history of being used for public health and education purposes. New development on the site should continue this tradition by including a range of uses supporting community health, families and senior citizens. There is a rich array of community support organizations in Lawrenceville, and throughout Pittsburgh. Ideally, the Clack Campus could facilitate an expansion of existing programs to better support neighborhood residents.

Arts, Making and Culture Uses

A similar opportunity exists for the Clack Campus to support local arts and culture. Lawrenceville has a strong community of artists, makers, and arts organizations, but as the neighborhood has become more expensive, many making spaces have been lost. The Clack Campus is an opportunity to integrate publiclyaccessible spaces for both creating and sharing creative practices of all kinds.

- 1. US 2020 Census data.census.gov data
- 4. cityofbridgesclt.org/ 6. coophousing.org/developerstoolbox/
- for Allegheny County census tract 603. 2. ura.org/pages/housing-resources
- 3 + 5. www.burlingtonassociates.com
- 7. https://www.cohousing.org/

EXAMPLES:



Belmar Gardens

The 118-unit cooperative, located in Pittsburgh, PA, was developed out of a need for middle-income African Americans to own their own homes because they were not welcomed into white neighborhoods in the 1950's. Photo source: Belmar Gardens website: belmargardens.com



Durham Central Park Cohousing

A 36-unit, self-developed cohousing project with shared communal dining spaces, music and art spaces and gardens in Durham, NC. Photo credit: Weinstein Friedlein Architects



Radiant Hall

A small, affordable studio space with shared amentities in a renovated builidng in Lawrenceville. Photo Credit: Radiant Hall

CAMPUS DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT PRACTICES

Projects on the Clack Campus should employ a range of sustainable development practices to reduce resource use, improve neighborhood ecosystems and mitigate impacts on the surrounding neighborhood.

Green Building

All building projects on the Clack Campus should strive to follow a green building performance standard intended to improve environmental performance, such as the US Green Building Council's Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED[®]) or The International Living Future Institute's Living Building Challenge[™]. A comparison of standards can be found on the EPA website <u>here</u>.

Occupant Health

Ensure that building materials, spaces and systems are designed with occupant health in mind. Consider using the WELL Building Standard, "a vehicle for buildings and organizations to deliver more thoughtful and intentional spaces that enhance human health and well-being. WELL includes strategies that aim to advance health by setting performance standards for design interventions, operational protocols and policies and a commitment to fostering a culture of health and well-being." More information can be found here.

Deconstruction & Material Reuse

Deconstruction is a systematic form of demolition salvaging materials for reuse or recycling. In the case of the partial or complete demolition of any building on the campus, deconstruction efforts should employ salvage, and recycle or reuse materials. <u>Construction Junction</u>, a Pittsburgh-based non-profit building material recycler, offers deconstruction services and could be a potential partner. 10

Native Planting & Tree Canopy

Site improvements to the Clack Campus should preserve and enhance natural ecosystems on the site to create positive impacts on habitat, and air and water quality. The existing tree canopy should be maintained and expanded if possible. Tree Pittsburgh has a variety of resources for urban forestry on its <u>website</u>. New landscape elements should utilize native plantings to conserve water, provide habitat, and reduce maintenance. Drought- and salt-tolerant plant species, providing overlapping bloom periods and visual interest, should be emphasized. Resources for designing landscapes with native plants can be found on the PA DCNR <u>website</u>. 12

EXAMPLES:



Material Reuse

Custom Front Desk, by Bones and All, at the TRYP Hotel in Lawrenceville. The desk incorporates salvaged materials. Repurposed gym floor boards are featured on the adjacent wall. Photo Source: www.monmade.org



Native Plantings

The campus landscape designed with native species at CMU's School of Computer Science Complex. Photo Credit: Michael Van Valkenburgh Associates Landscape Architects



Green Infrastructure

Permeable paving at the Instituto Cultural Tampico in Mexico. Photo Credit: Taller Venticuatro

Water

Water use in buildings should be minimized by design, and site permeability should be maximized with the construction of green infrastructure and landscape areas. Integrating green infrastructure best management practices (BMP)s into the site and along street edges can reduce stormwater runoff and improve the ecosystem of the site and adjacent park. Elements could potentially include green roofs, porous paving, trench drains, rain gardens and subsurface stormwater storage. More information on stormwater BMPs can be found <u>here</u>. In

Energy

The Clack Campus offers an opportunity to exceed required energy conservation standards and create a carbon neutral, or even carbon negative district, through a combination of high performance buildings and the use of renewable energy sources. The campus could potentially be a candidate for a zero-emission microgrid. At a minimum, the campus should embrace Pittsburgh's 2030 District goals for energy reduction, and commit to the district. More information on the 2030 District can be found <u>here</u>. 14

Dark Skies

Pittsburgh passed a Dark Sky ordinance in September of 2021 to regulate light pollution for city streets, parks and buildings. Projects on the Clack Campus should comply with this standard and use Dark Sky Lighting Principles. More information on dark-sky principles can be found on the International Dark-Sky Association website.

Transportation Demand Management

Transportation demand management planning (TDM) can reduce vehicular trips, parking demand, congestion, and pollution by encouraging the use of transit, cycling, and alternative means of transportation. TDM plans often include a managed approach to sharing parking between uses and times of day which could be appropriate for future and surrounding uses on the site. It is likely that the Pittsburgh Department of Mobility and Infrastructure will require a TDM plan for any major transformation of the Clack Campus. More information can be found <u>here.</u> 16

- 8. https://www.epa.gov/smartgrowth/green-building-standards
- 9. https://www.wellcertified.com/
- 10. https://cjreuse.org/donate/deconstruct/
- 11. https://www.treepittsburgh.org/resources/
- 12. https://www.dcnr.pa.gov/Conservation/WildPlants/LandscapingwithNativePlants/ Pages/default.aspx
- 13. http://www.stormwaterpa.org/from-the-foreword.html
- 14. https://www.2030districts.org/pittsburgh/district-goals
- 15. https://www.darksky.org/our-work/lighting/
- 16. https://apps.pittsburghpa.gov/redtail/images/4588_DOMI_TDM__Guidelines.pdf

EXAMPLES:



Pittsburgh 2030 District

The Pittsburgh 2030 district includes Downtown, Uptown, Oakland the Strip District and Central Northside, as well as other significant campuses of buildings. Image credit: - Green Building Alliance



Dark Skies Lighting

An example of dark-sky lighting in Harmony, Florida. Photo credit: International Dark-Sky Association (Jim Richardson)



Sustainable Modes of Transportation

Public transit and bicycle infrastructure in Pittsburgh. Photo Credit: Getty Images (arlutz73)

DEVELOPMENT APPROACHES

POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCES

To achieve the community goals, projects will likely need to seek a range of funding sources. This list is contains a number of significant sources of funding that may be relevant to the Clack Campus, but should not be seen as exhaustive.

Tax Credits

Income-producing development on the Clack Campus could qualify for tax-credit programs because the site is part of an eligible district, or particular uses are being created.

Low Income Housing Tax Credits (LITHC) are intended to support the creation of affordable housing. The program, operated by Federal Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), is the most important resource for creating affordable housing in the US. More information can be found at the PA Housing Finance Agency <u>website</u>. 17

New Markets Tax Credits (NMTC) encourage community development, using tax credits to attract private investment in lowincome communities. The Clack Campus is in an eligible district. More information can be found <u>here</u>. 18

Neighborhood Assistance Program, Enterprise Zone Tax

Credit (NAP/EZP) is a district-based tax credit intended for building rehabilitation or new development. The campus is in an eligible enterprise zone. More information can be found <u>here</u>. 19

Historic Preservation Tax Credits + Grants

The Allegheny Arsenal is part of the National Register Lawrenceville Historic District. As a contributing part of the District, historically-appropriate redevelopment proposals for the Clack Campus could be eligible to receive Federal and Pennsylvania Tax Credits. The Federal Historic Preservation Tax Incentives Program provides a 20% federal tax credit to property owners undertaking a substantial rehabilitation of a historic building with a commercial or other income-producing use, while maintaining its historic character. The PA Historic Preservation Tax Credit functions similarly. A competitive program, it can provide up to 25% of gualified expenditures, and be increased to 30% in connection with a workforce housing project. "All projects must include a qualified rehabilitation plan that is approved by the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission as being consistent with the Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings as adopted by the United States Secretary of the Interior." More information can be found here.

Save America's Treasures Grant provides funding for preservation and/or conservation work on nationally-significant properties that are either individually listed or within a National Register District. More information can be found <u>here</u>. ₂₁

URA Housing Opportunity Fund

The Housing Opportunity Fund (HOF) was created by the City of Pittsburgh to support the development and preservation of affordable and accessible housing in Pittsburgh. The HOF is administered by the Urban Redevelopment Authority of Pittsburgh (URA). A number of HOF programs could support affordable housing development on the Clack Campus. More information on the programs below can be found <u>here</u>. 22

The **Rental Gap Program** (RGP) "provides loans to nonprofit developers or developers with nonprofit partners for the creation and/or preservation of affordable units. The RGP is designed to increase the supply of affordable rental units."

The **Community Development Investment Fund** (CDIF) "is designed to assist non-profit, community-based organizations to participate in real estate projects that benefit low- and moderate-income persons.

The **For-Sale Development Program** (FSDP) provides "construction financing to nonprofit and for-profit developers for the substantial rehabilitation or new construction of for-sale housing."

The URA also has **Rental Housing Programs** that offer "financing products for rental housing development that can be used for developments that vary by size and tenant income."

HUD & HACP Affordable Housing Support

Together, HUD and the Housing Authority of the City of Pittsburgh (HACP) operate and support affordable housing in Pittsburgh.

Project Based Vouchers (PVB) allow for tenant-based Housing Choice Vouchers (HCV), administered by HUD and HACP, to be dedicated to a specific housing project to create affordable units in the project in partnership with a developer.

HACP **Gap Financing** provides last-resort gap financing loans for affordable rental housing projects seeking project-based vouchers. Both programs are administered by the HACP through an RFP process. Information can be found <u>here</u>. ₂₃

HUD Section 202 Supportive Housing for the Elderly Program "provides capital advances to finance the construction, rehabilitation or acquisition with or without rehabilitation of structures that will serve as supportive housing for very lowincome elderly persons, including the frail elderly, and provides rent subsidies for the projects to help make them affordable." More information can be found <u>here</u>. ₂₄ There is also a related demonstration project funding intergenerational dwelling units for intergenerational families in 202 projects.
Cooperative Housing Financing

National Cooperative Bank (NCB). Unlike most traditional banks, NCB "provides first mortgages, second mortgages and lines of credit to housing cooperatives, multifamily properties and other commercial property types." More information can be found here.

HUD Section 213 provides FHA mortgage insurance for cooperative housing. "HUD insures mortgages made by private lending institutions on cooperative housing projects of five or more dwelling units to be occupied by members of nonprofit cooperative ownership housing corporations." More information can be found <u>here</u>. 26

Value Capture

Tax Increment Financing (TIF) leverages the future tax value of a development project to borrow money to pay for infrastructure. TIF infrastructure "is partially financed through the issuing of revenue bonds or bank loans that are repaid by future increases in tax revenue resulting from the new development (tax increment)." The URA administers TIFs in the city. More information can be found here.

Tax Abatement Programs are available in the City of Pittsburgh to help create affordable for-sale and rental housing; to support larger, job-producing commercial projects; and to help property owners achieve visitability standards. Program information can be found here. 28

State Grants and Loans

Pennsylvania has a variety of programs designed to support economic development, cultural uses, recreation and green building. Some of the following programs may be able to support Clack Campus projects.

Redevelopment Assistance Capital Program (RCAP) is a "grant program administered by the Office of the Budget for the acquisition and construction of regional economic, cultural, civic, recreational, and historical improvement projects." More information can be found here. ₂₉

The High Performance Building Program (HPB) "provides financial assistance in the forms of grants and loan funds to underwrite the cost premiums associated with the design and construction or major renovation of high performance buildings in the state." More information can be found <u>here</u>. 30

The Marketing to Attract Tourists Program "provides funding to support and development international tourism, sports marketing, outdoor recreation, and cultural attractions." More information can be found <u>here</u>. ₃₁

Greenways, Trails and Recreation Program (GTRP) "supports projects which involve development, rehabilitation and improvements to public parks, recreation areas, greenways, trails and river conservation." More information can be found here. 32

Pennsylvania Infrastructure Investment Authority

(PennVEST) provides low-interest loans and grants for new construction, or for improvements to publicly- or privatelyowned drinking water, storm water or sewage treatment facilities, as well as non-point source pollution prevention best management practices. More information can be found <u>here</u>.

Renewable Energy Program (REP) "provides financial assistance in the forms of grant and loan funds to assist in implementing geothermal projects" and could assist in creating a green district energy system for the campus. More information can be found <u>here.</u> 34

Solar Energy Program (SEP) "provides financial assistance in the form of grant and loan funds to promote the use of solar energy in Pennsylvania" and could assist in creating a green district energy system for the campus. More information can be found <u>here</u>. 35

Alternative and Clean Energy Program (ACE) "provides financial assistance in the form of grant and loan funds that will be used by eligible applicants for the utilization, development and construction of alternative and clean energy projects in the state." More information can be found <u>here</u>. 76

Foundation Support

Pittsburgh's robust philanthropic community could also be a resource to help establish both affordable housing and community-serving uses on the Clack Campus.

- 17. https://www.phfa.org/mhp/developers/lihtc.aspx
- 18. https://www.ura.org/pages/new-markets-tax-credit-program
- https://dced.pa.gov/download/neighborhood-assistance-program-enterprise-zone-taxcredit-nap-ezp-guidelines/?wpdmdl=86207
- 20. https://dced.pa.gov/programs/historic-preservation-tax-credit-hptc/
- 21. https://www.nps.gov/subjects/historicpreservationfund/save-americas-treasures-grants. htm
- 22. https://www.ura.org/pages/housing-opportunity-fund-programs
- 23. https://hacp.org/doing-business/
- 24. https://www.hud.gov/program_offices/housing/mfh/progdesc/eld202
- 25. https://www.ncb.coop/sectors-we-serve/housing
- 26. https://www.hud.gov/hudprograms/cooph
- 27. https://www.ura.org/pages/tax-diversion-programs
- 28. https://pittsburghpa.gov/finance/real-estate-forms
- 29. https://www.budget.pa.gov/Programs/RACP/Pages/Main%20Page.aspx 30. https://dced.pa.gov/programs/high-performance-building-program-hpb/
- 31, https://dced.pa.gov/programs/marketing-to-attract-tourists/
- https://dced.pa.gov/programs/marketing-to-attract-tourists/
 https://dced.pa.gov/programs/greenways-trails-and-recreation-program-gtrp/
- https://dced.pa.gov/programs/pennsylvania-infrastructure-investment-authoritypennvest/
- 34. https://dced.pa.gov/programs/renewable-energy-program-rep-geothermal-windprojects/
- 35. https://dced.pa.gov/programs/solar-energy-program-sep/
- 36. https://dced.pa.gov/programs/alternative-clean-energy-program-ace/

35





APPENDIX

Community Values Survey Results	38
Community Values Survey	40
Affinity Group Feedback	44

COMMUNITY VALUES SURVEY RESULTS

3

4

As part of the public information-gathering process, a survey was designed with two goals in mind:

- 1. Confirming the themes and values identified by participants of Workshop #1; and,
- 2. Collecting additional input from community members who were unable to participate in Workshop #1.

The survey included several additional demographic questions used to identify specific groups of people who were underrepresented in the responses, and to focus additional outreach efforts to get input from a diverse set of community members.

The survey was available online and as a printed handout, to reach a broad audience and adhere to pandemic safety precautions. The online survey was promoted by the project team and steering committee via various social media and e-mail newsletters. Scannable QR codes and printed handouts were available at in-person events: the Lawrenceville Farmer's Market and Pop Up Market.

The online survey collected 169 responses, and the printed format was completed by 10 people. The survey document and a summary of results are presented below and on the following pages.

Incorporate outdoor public spaces to support community events such as an amphitheater or successful to other.	0000	Theme #5: DESIRED USE	s
covered structure.		This section includes uses that would enhance life in	
nclude designated spaces for pets and pet owners.	0000	Lawrenceville.	
What RECREATION + OPEN SPACE ideas are missing? (Option	onal)	Include affordable housing for a mix of incomes, ages, abilities and household sizes, with an emphasis on housing for families and older adults.	0000
		Activate the Arsenal Park edge with a use that enhances the park, such as a small restaurant or recreational use.	0000
Theme #4: HISTORY + REU	SE	Integrate affordable spaces for community and arts uses.	0000
This category thinks about the existing history of the site and its buildings.	thread the second	Support local businesses and employment opportunities with small scale commercial spaces and/or office space focused on Penn Avenue.	0000
Keep and renovate the existing buildings on the Clack site.	0000	Support the ability of Lawrenceville residents to	0000
Maintain the scale, rhythm, and campus character of the site by maintaining some open space.	0000	age in place with spaces for senior socializing and services.	0000
Design new buildings to harmonize with, but not mimic, the historic buildings with excellent design and high-quality materials.	0000	Provide spaces for education, ranging from early childhood to community college and vocational training spaces.	0000
Celebrate the history of the site with interpretive signage, and public art.	0000	What DESIRED USES ideas are missing? (Optional)	
Create a small museum to showcase the history of Lawrenceville and the Arsenal.	0000		
What HISTORY + REUSE ideas are missing? (Optional)			
		DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMAT	ION
		Pardon the personal questions, but including your demographic in us understand who is (and isn') filling out the survey. This helps u generalizations and know which groups we need to do more to re	s avoid making
		How old are you?	
		O Under 18 O 25 to 44 O 65 or	Dver
		O 18 to 24 O 45 to 64	
		~ ALMOST THERE! CONTINUED ON SEC	OND PAGE! ~



DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION cont'd Do you have a disability or identify as being Disabled? O Yes O No You like, please identify your disability.	Does your household own or rent your residence? O Own O Rent O Other: Other: Other than yourself, how many people are there in your household?	
What is your household income? O Less than \$10,000 \$75,000 to \$99,999 \$10,000 to \$24,999 \$100,000 to \$149,999 \$25,000 to \$499,999 \$150,000 or More \$50,000 to \$74,999 \$150,000 or More	Does your household have children under the age of 18? O Yes O No O Other: Email Address:	
Mhat of the following best describe your race / ethnicity? Choose all that apply O Asian or Pacific Islander O White O Black or African- American O American Indian or Alaskan Native	Zip Code: Thank you for your thoughts on the Clack Site in Lawrenceville. Please feel free to forward this survey to your neighbors and friends; all opinions matter and are	
Are you of Hispanic, Latino, or Spanish origin? O Yes O No	welcomed. If a resident does not have digital access to take this survey, and to arrange pick-up completed survey. Base contact the Lawrence/lile United offices at 412.802.7220 or info@LUnited.org. Hope to see you at our 2nd Workshops, dates TBD. Stay updated at LUnited.org	

COMMUNITY + PUBLIC BENEFITS

The people, diversity, and quality of life in Lawrenceville.

Incorporate safe and inclusive spaces accessible to all community members such as arts center, activity center, or small community event space.



Prioritize uses that benefit the community and support the needs of Lawrenceville's most marginalized residents.



Celebrate the vibrancy of the neighborhood with public art incorporated into public spaces and buildings.



Retain some uses on the site that support community health, such as the air quality monitoring station or family health center.



COMMUNITY VALUES SURVEY

CONNECTIVITY + ACCESSIBILITY

How people move around the site, and move through this areas of Lawrenceville.

Connect the site to Arsenal Park with new accessible and gentle pedestrian connections from Penn Ave.



Support pedestrian safety enhancements to the intersections at 39th and 40th Streets.



Make the open spaces on the site accessible and welcoming to the public.



Prioritize and support future users accessing the site by transit, cycling and walking.



Celebrate the historic perimeter wall while also enhancing pedestrian access into the site.



RECREATION + OPEN SPACE

The activities and uses of the outdoor public space, and its potential relationship with Arsenal Park.

Maintain the tree canopy on site and design landscapes that support biodiversity and wildlife.



Include recreational spaces to diversify and expand offerings in Arsenal Park and the neighborhood.



Provide space for community gardens and food production.



Incorporate outdoor public spaces to support community events such as an amphitheater or covered structure.



Include designated spaces for pets and pet owners.



COMMUNITY VALUES SURVEY

HISTORY + REUSE

The site's historical significance, and how future development will engage with the buildings and open spaces.

Maintain the scale, rhythm, and campus character of the site by maintaining some open space.



Celebrate the history of the site with interpretive signage, and public art.



Keep and renovate the existing buildings on the Clack site.



Create a small museum to showcase the history of Lawrenceville and the Arsenal.



Design new buildings to harmonize with, but not mimic, the historic buildings with excellent design and high-quality materials.



DESIRED USES

Uses and building types that would enhance life in Lawrenceville.

Activate the Arsenal Park edge with a use that enhances the park, such as a small restaurant or recreational use.



Integrate affordable spaces for community and arts uses.



Include affordable housing for a mix of incomes, ages, abilities and household sizes, with an emphasis on housing for families and older adults.



Support the ability of Lawrenceville residents to age in place with spaces for senior socializing and services.



Provide spaces for education, ranging from early childhood to community college and vocational training spaces.



Support local businesses and employment opportunities with small scale commercial spaces and/or office space focused on Penn Avenue.



AFFINITY GROUP FEEDBACK

TEXT HERE

- - - - -

APPENDIX

